Why We Need Reform

The facts about immigration and why we can’t afford to wait to fix our broken system

Todd Landfried
Arizona Employers for Immigration Reform
The Real Arizona Coalition
“A salient characteristic of the current debate on U.S. immigration policy is the high ratio of hot air to data.”

Dr. Douglas Massey
Co-director, Mexican Migration Project
Princeton University
mmp.opr.princeton.edu
The issue: Illegal immigration
Who said it: Steve Smith, state senator
Sen. Steve Smith, R-Manitou, made two claims about illegal immigrants: 1) half of them come into the United States through Arizona and 2) that... Read more

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration
View the analysis

The issue: Arizona's proportion of illegal-immigrant crossings
Who said it: Paul Babeu, Pinal County sheriff
Pinal County Sheriff Paul Babeu said half of all immigrants who cross the U.S. border illegally enter through Arizona.

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration, Public safety
View the analysis

The issue: Undocumented immigrants and wildfires
Who said it: Frank Antenori, state senator
Sen. Frank Antenori, R-Tucson, tweeted that Pinal County had banned fireworks and that consequently fireworks had started no fires. He tweeted... Read more

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration, Public safety, Federal government
View the analysis

The issue: $108 million spent for births to illegal immigrants
Who said it: Steve Smith, state senator
Sen. Steve Smith, R-Manitou, said 14-400 babies were born to illegal immigrants in Arizona in 2009, and he implied that the government spent... Read more

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration, Economy, Health
View the analysis

This item involved the Aug. 24, 2010, primary election

The issue: Benefits for illegal immigrants
Who said it: J.D. Hayworth
J.D. Hayworth accuses Sen. John McCain of lying in the past for political gain and accuses him of lying again during this Senate campaign. In... Read more

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration, Personal attacks
View the analysis

The issue: Beheadings in the desert
Who said it: Jan Brewer
Gov. Jan Brewer has made a few references to beheadings in the desert. We take a look at whether those statements are accurate.

Keyword(s): Border / Immigration, Public safety
View the analysis

This item involved the Nov. 2, 2010, general election

Source: AZ Fact Check immigration topic, updated 3/14/12
“A lie gets halfway around the world before the truth gets its boots on.”

Charles Haddon Spurgeon  
19th Century Minister
A "substantial number" of probationers participating in a pilot project to ease the farm labor shortage are able to "finish the work."

"Over 81 percent of the babies that are born at LBH Hospital right here in Houston are born of women who are not here legally."

"Illegal immigration costs state taxpayers over $3 billion every year."

"If you’re from Guatemala and you are found illegally in Mexico, you are automatically jailed."

Under current U.S. immigration policy, "literally one person with a green card" can, in the extreme, bring in more than 270 of his relatives.

"In Florida, illegal immigration costs taxpayers nearly $4 billion (a year). This amounts to $700 for every household in Florida."

Says over 25 percent of the Texas budget funds services to non-U.S. citizens.

"Phoenix, Ariz., is the No. 2 kidnapping capital of the world."

"Illegal aliens cost the state of Rhode Island $400 million a year."

"The federal government has not engaged in (border security) at all."

"Sixty percent of the Hispanics" support the Arizona immigration law.

"In 20 years there will be enough Muslim voters in the U.S. to elect the president by themselves."

Source: PolitiFact.com immigration topic, updated 3/14/12
## PolitiFact Immigration Checks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pants On Fire</th>
<th>FALSE</th>
<th>Mostly False</th>
<th>Half True</th>
<th>Mostly True</th>
<th>TRUE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2%</td>
<td>23.6%</td>
<td>19.0%</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wrong 87.5%</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AZ FactCheck: Immigration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FALSE</th>
<th>Mostly False</th>
<th>Somewhat False Somewhat True</th>
<th>Mostly True</th>
<th>TRUE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
<td>14.0%</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
<td>14.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Wrong 86%

Birthright Fallacy

**U.S. Citizen**
- Spouse: 3 years
- Minor Child: 7 years
- Sibling: 22 years

**Citizen Child**
- Parents: Ineligible - Penalty - Wait
- Siblings: Ineligible - Penalty - Wait

Years:
- 0: 38 years
- 6: 53 years

Source: U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service
## Crime Fallacies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unauthorized</th>
<th>Claim</th>
<th>Reality</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% in Federal Prison</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>17.5%</td>
<td>+200%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% in AZ Prisons*</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>+240%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violent Crime Drop 3X US Avg.</td>
<td>18.6%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
<td>+122%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hate Crime Increase ‘07-‘10</td>
<td>Not a problem</td>
<td>+68%</td>
<td>+6,800%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity Theft</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>-99.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Includes green card and undocumented prisoners
### Economic Fallacies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unauthorized</th>
<th>Claim</th>
<th>Reality</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education Costs</td>
<td>$810M</td>
<td>$379M</td>
<td>+214%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Costs</td>
<td>$400M</td>
<td>$24M</td>
<td>+1,600%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax Payments</td>
<td>$257M</td>
<td>$2.84B</td>
<td>-1,100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10% Percentage of California’s uncompensated health care in 2007 attributable to undocumented immigrant’s E.R. use

Source: California Hospital Association
13%

National percentage of “Hispanic or Latino” total E.R. visits in 2006

Source: National Hospital Ambulatory Medical Care Survey: 2006 Emergency Department Summary, Table 2: Number, percent distribution, and annual rate of emergency department visits with corresponding standard errors, by patient characteristics: United States, 2006
23% Percentage of total Arizona E.R. visits by Hispanics 2005

Source: ASU Center for Health Information & Research, Race/Ethnicity, Figure 4.
50% Percent undocumented immigrants are *less likely* to use emergency rooms than native Latinos

Source: Sampson, Morenoff, et. al.: Public Health Matters, Vol. 95., No. 2
2.1

The number of fewer doctor visits of undocumented Hispanics compared with their US-born counterparts

Source: Alexander N. Ortega, PhD, et.al; *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 2007;167(21): 2354-2360
Immigrant’s per-person unadjusted medical expenditures compared to U.S. born, even with full insurance

Source: Alexander N. Ortega, PhD, et.al; *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 2007;167(21): 2354-2360
“The greatest threat to democracy is having a public that thinks it is fully informed, but really isn’t very well informed at all.”

Linda Foley
We Should Have Known Better

- Prince William County, VA (2007) - $14.9M to train county officers; foreclosure rate 3X regional rate; business closures up 45%

- Farmer’s Branch, TX (2007) - $5M in lawsuit costs, increased vacancy rates, lower property values, businesses closed

- Hazelton, PA (2007) - $5M in lawsuit costs, increased foreclosure and vacancy rates, lower property values, businesses closed

- Oklahoma Taxpayer & Citizen Protection Act (2007) - Oklahoma Bankers Association study found the loss of 90,000 unauthorized workers/families resulted in net Gross State Product loss of $1.9B

State of Arizona

- Legal Arizona Workers Act (2007)
  - Has resulted in the hiring of fewer undocumented workers
  - Has reduced undocumented population by 92,000 unrelated to the recession
  - BUT - a dramatic shift to cash-based, self-employment, thus weakening the tax base
  - Reduced size of the labor pool in construction, retail, restaurant, hospitality and agriculture businesses

Source: Public Policy Institute of California. [www.ppic.org/content/pubs/report/R_311MLR.pdf](http://www.ppic.org/content/pubs/report/R_311MLR.pdf)
State of Arizona

  - $3M+ to defend SB 1070 in court
  - $5M+ to train law enforcement
  - $300M+ in convention and related tourism losses since 2010
  - $14.4B loss in Arizona GSP
  - 172,000 related job losses
  - $40.7M loss in state tax revenues
Sound Good?

✓ Shrinking workforce
✓ Significant population loss
✓ Significantly fewer consumers
✓ Business layoffs & closures
✓ Broad tax base decline
✓ Foreclosures up, values down
✓ Damage to business climate
✓ Loss of investment interest
They Didn’t Pay Attention

Alabama
Indiana
Georgia
South Carolina
Utah
Georgia: Following AZ’s Lead

- Ignoring history and evidence of failures, GA bill was signed on May 12, 2011
- Georgia felt the impact *within days*
  - Farmers lost field workers during prime spring harvest season and the state’s Farm Bureau projected immediate losses at $330M
  - Gov. Deal called for impact study 14 days *AFTER* the law was passed
  - “Pilot” probationer employment program for agriculture failed miserably: needed 11,000 and 14 showed up and seven remained a week later
Prison Farm Labor?

How many support giving prison laborers this knife?
Alabama: Following AZ’s Lead

- Alabama’s law signed on June 9, 2011
- Alabama felt the impact **within days**
  - Construction industry stalled as workers leave, slowing down rebuilding process following spring tornado storms
  - Mercedes Benz executive arrested for lack of ID
  - Long-term growers of hand-picked crops are switching to crops that can be mechanized
Quiz

Doing the same thing over and over and expecting a different result is the definition of...

INSANITY
“Enforcement First” Fails - Always

- Non-federal immigration laws have not worked anywhere
- **No study exists** that shows positive impacts of any state-level immigration law
- *All* studies show negative economic and social consequences
- Successful Russell Pearce recall shows sensible immigration reform can be a winning campaign issue
- Federal reform is impossible without state and local pressure
Successful Immigration Reforms

1. Immigration Reform and Control Act (IRCA) 1986 - “Reagan Amnesty”
2. Immigration Act of 1990
4. Illegal Immigration and Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996
5. Secure Fence Act of 2006

*No Immigration Reform Bill Has Passed In 17 years*
Failed Immigration Reform Efforts

1. Border Protection, Antiterrorism & Illegal Immigration Reform Act 2005
2. Comprehensive Immigration Reform Act (McCain/Kennedy) 2006
4. Real Enforcement With Practical Answers for Immigration Reform Plan ’10
5. DREAM Act (Senate) 2010
6. Removal Clarification Act of 2010 (includes DREAM Act)
Current Efforts


2. House Immigration Reform Framework 2014
## Quick Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>feature</th>
<th>Senate S. 744</th>
<th>House Framework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Border Security</td>
<td>Yes - priority</td>
<td>Yes - priority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visa Reform</td>
<td>Yes - comprehensive</td>
<td>Yes - limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship</td>
<td>Pathway</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Status</td>
<td>Pathway w/conditions</td>
<td>Pathway w/conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DREAMers</td>
<td>Yes w/conditions</td>
<td>Yes w/conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Verify/Employer Rules</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application Backlog</td>
<td>Cleared prior to new app</td>
<td>Did not address</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What Will Happen? Who Knows?

- What will and what should are two different things
- Status quo is not an option
- Biggest mistake is insisting on enforcement first - that doesn’t work
- Must address labor and security issues *at the same time*
  - Makes border security attainable more quickly
  - Greatly reduces costs and creates a much more humane solution
- One thing’s certain: reform won’t happen without…
You demanding it!
Thank You

Todd Landfried
Arizona Employers for Immigration Reform
Email: todd@azeir.org

www.azeir.org