The Role of Community Health Centers in Addressing Human Trafficking

Arizona Alliance for Community Health Centers
2019 Symposium on the Intersection of Health and Interpersonal Violence
Phoenix, Arizona
June 18, 2019

Kimberly S.G. Chang, MD, MPH
Asian Health Services
Oakland, CA
Disclosures / Fair Use Doctrine

- Neither I nor any member of my immediate family has a financial relationship or interest with any proprietary entity producing health care goods or services related to the content of this CME activity. My content will not include any discussion or reference of any commercial products or services. I do not intend to discuss an unapproved or investigative use of commercial products or devices.

- This presentation includes the creative work of others which is being used under a claim of educational fair use pursuant to 17 USC 107. This presentation was prepared pursuant to the Fair Use Guidelines, and no further distribution is permitted. This notice is required by the Fair Use Guidelines.
“It’s like if you die, get murdered or something, all it is they have another girl taking their place. That’s all it is.”

-- Cambodian American Teenage Patient at AHS
“I been raped two times. Then I been tortured by two guys in two days.”

-- Cambodian American Teenage Patient at AHS
“So...I’m tired...girls dying, people catching AIDS, so I don’t want to be doing it because that can be me.”

-- Cambodian American Teenage Patient at AHS
Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA)

Human Trafficking (HT) is

A. Sex trafficking:
   1. A commercial sex act induced by force, fraud, or coercion,
   2. Or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age

B. Labor Trafficking: The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.
The Systems Intersect

Criminal Justice

Healthcare

Healing of Patients / Victims & Prosecution of Traffickers
System Differences

Criminal Justice Framework
- Goal: uphold laws of the state
- Victims
- More Defined Timeframe
- Justice Orientation
- Government Based
- Punish Traffickers

Healthcare & Prevention Framework
- Goal: advance patients’ and population health
- Patients
- Long-term Process
- Individual Orientation
- Community Based
- Prevent/Treat Harms

© 2017 K. CHANG
Who is Vulnerable to Human Trafficking?

Who is invisible, or harder to see in your state?

- Runaway and homeless youth
- Immigrants and refugees
- Native populations
- LGBTQ youth
- H2A and H2B Visa workers

3 D’s: Jobs that are Dirty, Dangerous, Degrading
A Continuum and Overlap

LABOR TRAFFICKING
- Poor Sanitary Living Conditions
- Occupational Safety and Health Hazards
- Poor Working Conditions
- Toxic Exposures
- Wage and Labor Violations / Exploitation
- Deprivation of Food / Water / Healthcare
- Physical / Psychological / Sexual Abuse
- Migrant Labor Force

SEX TRAFFICKING
- Child Abuse and Neglect
- Child Sexual Abuse
- Intimate Partner Violence
- Community Violence
- Sexual Assault / Rape
- Compelled Criminal Activity
- Poor Sanitary Living Conditions
- Deprivation of Food / Water / Healthcare
- Physical / Psychological Abuse
- Intergenerational Trauma
- Homelessness
Do we provide care for trafficked patients?

- Trafficked People
  - Immigrants
  - Exploited Workers
  - Victims of Violence, Torture
  - Sex Workers

Zimmerman et al, LSTHM, 2003
Indicators: Labor Trafficking

- Workplace abuse and restrictions
- Owes a large debt and is unable to pay it off
- Is not in control of his/her own ID documents
- Was recruited through false promises
- Is unpaid or paid very little

National Human Trafficking Resource Center, 2016
Indicators: Sex Trafficking

- Evidence of controlling or dominating relationships
- Signs of physical and/or sexual abuse
- Lack of control of own money/finances
- Signs of drug or alcohol abuse
- Inappropriate dress for weather or situation

National Human Trafficking Resource Center, 2016
While being trafficked:

- 87.8% of trafficked victims encountered a health care provider and 57.1% visited a clinic\(^1\)
- 28-50% of victims in the US encounter health care professionals while being trafficked\(^2,3\)
  - *None were identified as being trafficked*

Some trafficked minors may disclose if screened in a clinic\(^4\)
  - *CAN be identified in a health care setting*

There are models of care for victims of HT, and those who are vulnerable \(^5,6\)
  - *Once identified, there are ways for health care to respond; AND we can universally educate / provide prevention*

---

## Who they meet

Victims encounter a variety of health care professionals while being trafficked

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of victims * who came in contact with health care professionals (by specialty)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PEDIATRICIAN</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TRADITIONAL/ALTERNATIVE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DENTIST</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>OB/GYN</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRIMARY CARE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EMERGENCY DEPARTMENT</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DON’T KNOW</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>OTHER</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Some of the 117 victims surveyed received services from more than one category of provider.


Related study: Chisolm-Straker M, Richardson L. Assessment of emergency department provider knowledge about human trafficking victims in the ED. Acad Emerg Med. 2007; 14 (suppl1): 134
Harms of Human Trafficking

**Medical**
- Occupational Safety Hazards
- Toxic Exposures
- Sexually Transmitted Infections
- Unintended Pregnancy
- Violence
- Traumatic Brain Injury / Strangulation
- Trauma / Injuries
- Lack of primary care
- Malnutrition
- Poor Oral Health
- Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs)

**Mental Health**
- Depression
- Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
- Anxiety/Panic
- Dissociation
- Relationship Difficulties
- Substance Use Disorders
- Suicidal Ideation
- Low Self-Esteem
- Blunted Emotional Response
- Excessive Guilt / Shame

**Social**
- Criminalization
- Stigmatization
- Lack of Formal Education
- Lack of Economic Opportunity
- Afraid to Access Care: reporting concerns
- Lack of Access to Health Care and other Social Services

“DH”

“Yeah I did it. Because she bought me some video games I wanted.”
“OT”

“He said that he would fire me, my husband, my brother-in-law, and all the Chin employees at the restaurant!”
“SZ”

“They’re out there, all trying to poison me!”
“BK”

“I’d rather die than go back to jail!”
Asian Health Services Responds to Human Trafficking
AHS’ Four Prong Approach to HT

1. OUTREACH: Reproductive Health Youth Program
2. DIRECT SERVICE: Teen Clinic, Primary Pediatric / Family Care for confidential Reproductive Health Services, School-Based Health Clinics
3. PREVENTION / HEALTH EDUCATION: Banteay Srei – youth development program specifically for sexually exploited youth or those at risk for exploitation
4. ADVOCACY / POLICY / RESEARCH: informing health policy via advocacy and research
AHS Programs and Policy Initiatives for HT

**Direct Service**
- Outreach:
  - Youth Program
  - Community Orgs
- Youth Development:
  - Banteay Srei
- Clinical
  - Teen Clinic / Primary Care
  - Behavioral / Mental Health Integration

**Partnerships**
- Community Orgs
- Medical Legal
- District Attorney

**Research**
- Original Research:
  - Screening Tool
  - Protocol Development
  - Evaluation of Clinical Risk Indicators
- Inform Research:
  - IOM
  - Academic participation
  - Teaching
  - Technical Assistance
  - Textbook chapters

**Policy Work**
- Local:
  - Alameda County Sexually Exploited Minor Network
  - Mayor Summit and School District
  - County Medical Association
- State:
  - California Child Welfare Council CSEC Committee
- National:
  - National District Attorneys Association
  - Office on Trafficking in Persons / National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center
  - HEAL Trafficking, Inc
  - National Advisory Committee
FQHCs on the Leading Edge of HT / Healthcare Intersection

- Futures Without Violence Project Catalyst II regarding Human Trafficking and Intimate Partner Violence via collaborative work in PCAs and State DV Coalitions
  - Pacific Islands, North Carolina, Colorado, Idaho, Iowa, Connecticut, Arkansas, and Minnesota

- Arizona Alliance for Community Health Centers
  - Annual Symposium on the Intersection of Health and Interpersonal Violence

- Hawaii: Kokua Kalihi Valley and the Pacific Survivor Center

- California: Alameda Health Consortium, La Maestra Community Health Center

- There are other FQHCs with HT programs across the country
Resources

- National Human Trafficking Resource Center
  - 1-888-373-7888
  - www.traffickingresourcecenter.org

- The Administration for Children and Families / Office of Trafficking in Persons – SOAR Trainings
  - www.acf.hhs.gov/endtrafficking

  - www.healtrafficking.org

- Futures Without Violence
  - Universal Education CUES Trainings
  - https://www.futureswithoutviolence.org/human-trafficking/
  - IPV Health Partners Website
PROTOCOL TOOLKIT
for Developing a Response to
Victims of Human Trafficking
in Health Care Settings

Source: https://healtrafficking.org/linkagesresources/protocol-toolkit/
SOAR to Health and Wellness Training

https://www.acf.hhs.gov/otip/training/soar-to-health-and-wellness-training
Health centers are key to violence prevention

www.ipvhealthpartners.org
Developed by and for community health centers in partnership with domestic violence programs
DV / SA / HT National Hotlines

National Domestic Violence
http://www.thehotline.org/
1-800-799-SAFE (7233)
TTY: 1-800-787-3224
• Live chat 24/7/365
• En Español: 12pm-6pm Hora Central

The Trevor Project
www.thetrevorproject.org
866-488-7386 LGBTQ Youth

National Sexual Assault
https://www.rainn.org/
1-800-656-HOPE (4673)

StrongHearts Native Helpline
www.strongheartshelpline.org
1-844-7NATIVE (762-8483)
• safe, anonymous and confidential service for Native Americans affected by DV
• Monday-Friday 9am-5:30pm CST

Trans Lifeline
1-877-565-8860
www.translifeline.org/

National Human Trafficking
www.humantraffickinghotline.org
1-888-373-7888
Text Help to 233733 (BeFree)
3:00pm-11:00pm EST
“I have nightmares about it. I almost died...most times I had been with these clients, they don’t really do anything to me. They’ll beat me up and rape me and stuff like that. But I’m just glad I don’t have no AIDS or STDs or died...”

American Teenager
Current Immigration Policies Impacting Vulnerabilities To Human Trafficking

- DOJ rules that some DV and gang violence are not grounds for asylum, June 2018: [https://www.justice.gov/eoir/page/file/1070866/download](https://www.justice.gov/eoir/page/file/1070866/download)


“BK”
“When nothing seems to help, I go and look at a stonecutter hammering away at his rock perhaps a hundred times without as much as a crack showing in it. Yet at the hundred and first blow it will split in two, and I know it was not that blow that did it, but all that had gone before.”

-- Jacob Riis
Let’s work together to end human trafficking...

Kimberly S.G. Chang, MD, MPH

kchang@ahschc.org
References


References

15. Chang, Kimberly S. G.; Lee, Kevin; Park, Terrence; Sy, Elizabeth; and Quach, Thu (2015) "Using a Clinic-based Screening Tool for Primary Care Providers to Identify Commercially Sexually Exploited Children," Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for Children at Risk: Vol. 6: Iss. 1, Article 6.

16. Interview with Dr. Nicole Littenberg, Founder of Pacific Survivor Center, and Physician at Kokua Kalihi Valley Community Health Center, Honolulu, Hawaii. February 2015.